

A BEGO

Confiaste en mi cuando otros dudaban
Te aseguraste de que mis sueños no fueran sueños rotos
Me diste siempre consejo generoso
No eres sólo amiga: hay cosas que pueden más que la sangre

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank the members of the STEMMA Project for their support in the last years and for helping me to pursue the research started by the team. Matthew Spencer deserves special thanks for having read parts of this work and having offered useful comments and advice. The Canterbury Tales Project also offered assistance every step of the way, and for this I am grateful.

I would like to thank the librarians at the Christ Church College Library, Oxford, for allowing me access to Ch, to the British Library for granting special permission to see Ha4 and Ad3, and to Ceridwen Lloyd-Morgan in the National Library of Wales for taking Hg from its place in the exhibition and for allowing me to request her confirmation of some of my findings.

I owe much more to David Hoover than appears in this work. He allowed me to take up his time with my endless chatter, even when he was so busy that he had to warn me “I am looking at the computer, but I am still listening.” And he *was* listening; but it was more than that, he understood what I meant (sometimes I have thought that he understands me better than I do myself). I would also like to thank professors Martha Rust and Mary Carruthers for their support and advice.

My family has had an incredibly difficult period, which is not yet over, but even during this hard time they have been most encouraging; and in words and acts have showed me that my own circumstances are not as hard as I imagine them to be. My friends have played no small part in the completion of my work and for this reason I

thank Andrew West (he has got a Mac now, and will not be able to get off the hook so easily), Alyssa Leal and Mindy Hung. Special thanks are due to Jennifer Marshall for having read my work and given me valuable suggestions to improve it.

Peter Robinson has showed the most unbelievable patience and understanding and has gone beyond his duty by reading this work as many times as have my official supervisors. I just hope that one day I may have an opportunity to return so many favors. In the end, all my “best ideas” have something to do with him one way or another.

Finally, my dearest friend, Bego, to whom this work is dedicated and who has been much more than a friend for so many years. This does not begin to repay her for all she has done for me.

ABSTRACT

Since Furnivall's *Six-Text Edition*, the order of the *Canterbury Tales* has been a matter of concern for many scholars interested in Chaucer's work. Moreover, this issue is faced by all editors of the text, since the tales need to be arranged in a specific sequence or in a series of sequences, as suggested by Pearsall when he proposed an edition in booklets.

This work is an interdisciplinary approach that uses computer technologies in combination with traditional codicological analysis to study the relationships between the different tale orders in the 58 more or less complete manuscripts and fifteenth century editions of the *Tales*. This work is organized in seven chapters. Chapter 1 focuses on scholarly work relating to the order of the *Canterbury Tales*; chapter 2 presents a brief history of the stemmatic approach to the criticism of texts; chapter 3 explores the possibility of studying the order of the *Tales* from a stemmatic perspective; chapter 4 presents the results of the use of phylogenetic software applied to the study of the order of the tales and analyses these results; chapter 5 analyses the relationships between the tale-order and the word-variant stemmata; chapter 6 presents codicological analyses of Ad3 Ch Cp Dd Ha4 and Hg. The findings of this work are presented in the conclusion (chapter 7), where the implications of the different orders are considered.

It is a known fact that some scribes accidentally altered the order of the *Tales* (as the Hg scribe did), but this work shows that some scribes altered the order intentionally. Codicological evidence suggests that both Ch and Ha4 added the Tale of Gamelyn to their texts when this tale was not part of their copy-texts. The conclusion of this work also suggests that further codicological analyses of the witnesses of the *Canterbury Tales* could still cast some light on the developments of manuscripts with **b**, **c** or **d** tale-orders as well as elucidate or suggest the places in the textual tradition in which these orders might have originated.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DEDICATION.....	IV
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	V
ABSTRACT.....	VII
LIST OF FIGURES	XII
LIST OF TABLES.....	XIII
LIST OF PLATES	XIV
LIST OF APPENDIXES	XV
ABBREVIATIONS	XVII
<i>Witness Sigils</i>	<i>xvii</i>
Manuscripts	<i>xvii</i>
Pre-1500 Printed Editions	<i>xix</i>
<i>Abbreviations for Tales and Links</i>	<i>xx</i>
INTRODUCTION.....	1
1. CONCEPTS AND IDEAS USED THROUGHOUT THIS WORK.....	1
1.1 <i>The Concept of</i>	
<i>O</i>	<i>1</i>
1.2 <i>Variants</i>	<i>4</i>
1.2.1 Variants and Readings.....	<i>4</i>
1.2.2 Word-Variants vs. Tale-Order Variants	<i>4</i>
2. BRIEF NOTES ON TEXTUAL CRITICISM.....	5
2.1 <i>The Intentionalist School</i>	5
2.2 <i>McGann and the Sociological Approach</i>	7
2.3 <i>The Editing of Medieval Texts</i>	8
3. THE ORGANIZATION OF THIS WORK	8
CHAPTER I: A HISTORICAL SURVEY OF THE SCHOLARSHIP CONCERNING THE TALE-ORDER PROBLEM... ..	10

CHAPTER II: A HISTORY OF THE STEMMATIC APPROACH TO THE CRITICISM OF TEXTS	39
1. CLASSICAL STEMMATICS: THE LACHMANN METHOD	39
2. RE-THINKING THE LACHMANN METHOD	41
2.1 <i>Henri Quentin: Considering All Variants</i>	41
2.2 <i>Joseph Bédier: ‘Best Text’ Editing</i>	43
2.3 <i>The Influence of the Anglo-American School</i>	45
2.4 <i>Paul Maas: Describing the Lachmann Method</i>	48
2.5 <i>Reactions against Maas’ Lachmann Method</i>	49
2.6 <i>Steps towards a Revision of the Genetic Method</i>	53
2.7 <i>Modern Genetic Methods: The New Stemmatics</i>	56
2.7.1 <i>Using Phylogenetic Software with Manuscript Traditions</i>	56
2.7.2 <i>Ben Salemans: The Neo-Lachmannian Approach</i>	59
2.7.3 <i>Robinson and the STEMMA Project</i>	61
CHAPTER III: STEMMATIC ANALYSIS AND TALE ORDER	66
1. MANLY AND RICKERT’S ASSESSMENT OF THE TALE-ORDER PROBLEM	66
1.1 <i>The Word-Variant Manuscript Groups</i>	67
1.2 <i>The Independent Circulation Hypothesis</i>	70
1.3 <i>The Tale-Order Manuscript Groups</i>	75
1.4 <i>Comparing Tale-Order and Word-Variant Groups</i>	77
2. ROBINSON’S REVISION OF THE WORD-VARIANT GROUPS	80
3. RECONCILING THE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN ROBINSON’S AND MANLY AND RICKERT’S GROUPS	89
CHAPTER IV: ANALYSIS OF THE TREES PRODUCED USING PHYLOGENETIC SOFTWARE	90
1. METHODS OF PHYLOGENETIC ANALYSIS	90
1.1 <i>How does Phylogenetic Software Work?</i>	91
1.2 <i>Different Tree-Building Methods</i>	92
1.2.1 <i>Distance vs. Discrete Methods</i>	92
1.2.2 <i>Clustering vs. Search Methods</i>	94

1.2.2.1 Testing the Tree-building Methods	95
1.2.3 Split Decomposition.....	97
2. PHYLOGENETIC SOFTWARE AND THE ORDER OF THE <i>CANTERBURY TALES</i>	98
2.1 <i>SplitsTree's Tale-Order Stemmata</i>	100
2.2 <i>PAUP and Tale-Order Stemmata</i>	102
2.2.1 Stemmata Based on Data Encoded Using Breakpoint Distance.....	102
2.2.2 Stemmata Based on Data Encoded Using IEBP	110
CHAPTER V: RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE TALE-ORDER AND THE WORD-VARIANT STEMMATA	116
CHAPTER VI: CODICOLOGICAL ANALYSIS AND ITS IMPLICATIONS FOR THE TALE-ORDER PROBLEM.....	134
1. CODICOLOGICAL ANALYSIS	135
1.1 <i>Hg: Peniarth 392D, National Library of Wales</i>	135
1.2 <i>Cp: Oxford, Corpus Christi College, MS 198</i>	145
1.3 <i>Ha4: British Library, MS Harleian 7334</i>	149
1.4 <i>The Order of the a Manuscripts (Gg: Cambridge, University Library, Gg.4.27, Dd: Cambridge, University Library, Dd.4.24, El: San Marino, California, Huntington Library, MS 26.C.9)</i>	154
1.4.1 <i>Dd: Cambridge, University Library, Dd.4.24</i>	154
1.4.2 <i>El: San Marino, California, Huntington Library, MS 26.C.9</i>	161
1.4.3 <i>Gg: Cambridge, University Library, Gg.4.27</i>	163
1.5 <i>Ad3: British Library, MS Additional 35286</i>	165
1.6 <i>Ch: Oxford, Christ Church College, MS 152</i>	168
2. A DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVE CONCERNING THE ORDER IN KEY MANUSCRIPTS	173
CONCLUSION.....	177
1. IMPLICATIONS OF THE DIFFERENT TALE-ORDERS IN THE MANUSCRIPTS OF THE <i>CANTERBURY TALES</i>	177

1.1 <i>When the Scribes Know What to Do</i>	177
1.1.1 The Cook's Tale (CO)	177
1.1.2 The Tale of Gamelyn (TG).....	179
1.2 <i>When the Scribes Do Not Know What to Do</i>	180
1.2.1 The Squire's Tale (SQ)	180
1.3 <i>Could a Scribe Have Left Text Out?</i>	182
1.3.1 The Canon's Yeoman's Tale (CY) and L33.....	182
1.4 <i>Altering the Order of the Tales</i>	183
2. SUMMARY OF HYPOTHESES ADVANCED BY THIS WORK.....	186
2.1 <i>Manly and Rickert's Tale-Order Classification</i>	185
2.2 <i>Refining Manly and Rickert's Groupings</i>	188
2.3 <i>Tale-Order and the New Stemmatics</i>	190
2.4 <i>Tale-order and Word-variants</i>	192
2.5 <i>Further Research</i>	193
APPENDIXES.....	250
WORKS CITED.....	290

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. A partial stemma of the b group, from Manly and Rickert.....	68
Figure 2. A possible stemma based on my research on Cx2.	86
Figure 3. A partial view of the parsimony consensus tree based on the GP data.....	120
Figure 4. A hypothesized stemma with the position of E1	124
Figure 5. The first lines of L37 in Hg.....	140
Figure 6. Gloss in folio 58v of Ha4.....	151
Figure 7. The first lines of L37 in Ch.....	169
Figure 8. Gloss after CO in Hg.....	177

List of TABLES

Table 1. A colored version of Manly and Rickert's Tale-Order Table.....	242
Table 2. Modified Table.....	246
Table 3. Divisions of the <i>Canterbury Tales</i>	249
Table 4. A comparison of the different groupings.....	250

LIST OF PLATES

Plate 1. BreakPoint Distance Upper Bound Tree SplitsTree Graph.....	196
Plate 2. BreakPoint Distance Lower Bound SplitsTree Graph.....	197
Plate 3. BreakPoint Distance Upper Bound SplitsTree Graph (Forcing Triangle Inequalities).	198
Plate 4. BreakPoint Distance Lower Bound SplitsTree Graph (Forcing Triangle Inequalities).....	199
Plate 5. BreakPoint Distance Upper Bound Phylogram Rooted at Hg.....	200
Plate 6. BreakPoint Distance Lower Bound Phylogram Rooted at Hg.....	201
Plate 7. BreakPoint Distance Upper Bound Unrooted Cladogram.....	202
Plate 8. BreakPoint Distance Lower Bound Unrooted Cladogram.....	203
Plate 9. BreakPoint Distance Upper Bound Unrooted Phylogram.....	204
Plate 10. BreakPoint Distance Lower Bound Unrooted Phylogram.....	205
Plate 11. Tale-Order Inverse of Expected BreakPoint SplitsTree Graph.....	206
Plate 12. Tale-Order Inverse of Expected BreakPoint SplitsTree Graph (forcing triangle inequalities).....	207
Plate 13. Tale-Order Inverse of Expected BreakPoint Distance Unrooted Cladogram.....	208
Plate 14. Inverse of Expected BreakPoint Distance Unrooted Phylogram.....	209
Plate 15. GPWS1 (General Prologue, lines 1-250) SplitsTree Graph.....	210
Plate 16. GPWS1 Parsimony Unrooted Phylogram.....	211
Plate 17. GPWS1 Distance Unrooted Phylogram.....	212
Plate 18. GPWS2 (General Prologue, lines 1-250).....	213
Plate 19. GPWS2 Parsimony Unrooted Phylogram 1.....	214
Plate 20. GPWS2 Parsimony Unrooted Phylogram 2.....	215
Plate 21. GPWS2 Parsimony Unrooted Phylogram 3.....	216
Plate 22. GPWS2 Parsimony Unrooted Phylogram Consensus.....	217

Plate 23. GPWS2 Parsimony Unrooted Phylogram Distance.....	218
Plate 24. GPWS7 (General Prologue, lines 251-500) SplitsTree Graph.....	219
Plate 25. GPWS7 Parsimony Unrooted Phylogram.....	220
Plate 26. GPWS7 Distance Unrooted Phylogram.....	221
Plate 27. GPWS9 (General Prologue, lines 501-end) SplitsTree Graph.....	222
Plate 28. Parsimony Unrooted Phylogram.....	223
Plate 29. GPWS9 Distance Unrooted Phylogram.....	224
Plate 30. BreakPoint Distance Upper Bound Unrooted Cladogram, with experimental order and modified orders.....	225
Plate 31. BreakPoint Distance Upper Bound Unrooted Phylogram, with experimental order and modified orders.....	226
Plate 32. BreakPoint Distance Lower Bound Unrooted Cladogram, with experimental order and modified orders.....	227
Plate 33. BreakPoint Distance Lower Bound Unrooted Phylogram, with experimental order and modified orders.....	228
Plate 34. Stemma based on WBP data (lines 301-400). Taken from Robinson, “Stemmatic” 76.....	229
Plate 35. Stemma based on WBP data (lines 401-500). Taken from Robinson, “Stemmatic” 77.....	230
Plate 36. The end of CO in Ad3 (folio 215v).....	231
Plate 37. The End of CO in Ch (folio 56v).....	232
Plate 38. The end of CO in Cp (folio 62r).....	233
Plate 39. The end of CO in Dd (folio 53v).....	234
Plate 40. The end of CO in Ha4 (folio 58v).....	235
Plate 41. The beginning of TG in Ha4 (folio 59r).....	236
Plate 42. The end of SQ in Ad3 (folio 131v).....	237
Plate 43. The end of SQ in Ch (folio 228v).....	238
Plate 44. The end of SQ in Cp (folio 99v).....	239
Plate 45. The end of SQ in Dd (folio 127r).....	240

Plate 46. The end of SQ in Hg (folio 137v).....241

LIST OF APPENDIXES

1. Nexus File: Upper Bound BreakPoint Distance.....	251
2. Nexus File: Lower Bound BreakPoint Distance	259
3. Nexus File: IEBP	267
4. Nexus File: Upper Bound BreakPoint Distance (with Modified Witnesses).....	274
5. Nexus File: Lower Bound BreakPoint Distance (with Modified Witnesses).....	289

ABBREVIATIONS

Witness Sigils

Manuscripts

- Ad1 London, British Library, MS. Add. 5140
Ad2 London, British Library, MS. Add. 25718
Ad3 London, British Library, MS. Add. 35286
Ad4 London, British Library, MS. Add. 10340
Bo1 Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS. Bodl. 414
Bo2 Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS. Bodl. 686
Bw Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS. Barlow 20
Ch Oxford, Christ Church College, MS. 152
Cn Austin, University of Texas, Humanities Research Center, MS. 143 (ex Cardigan)
Cp Oxford, Corpus Christi College, MS. 198
Ct Manchester, Chetham's Library, MS. 6709
Dd Cambridge, University Library, MS. Dd.4.24
Dl Tokyo, Takamiya MS 24 (ex Delamere)
Ds1 Tokyo, Takamiya MS 32 (ex Devonshire)
El California, San Marino, Huntington Library, MS. El. 26 C 9 (Ellesmere)
En1 London, British Library, MS. Eg. 2726
En2 London, British Library, MS. Eg. 2863
En3 London, British Library, MS. Eg. 2864
Fi Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum, MS. McClean 181
Gg Cambridge, University Library, MS. Gg.4.27
Gl Glasgow, Hunterian Museum, MS. U.1.1 (197)
Ha1 London, British Library, MS. Harley 1239
Ha2 London, British Library, MS. Harley 1758
Ha3 London, British Library, MS. Harley 7333
Ha4 London, British Library, MS. Harley 7334
Ha5 London, British Library, MS. Harley 7335

He New Jersey, Princeton University Library, MS. 100 (Helmingham)
 Hg Aberystwyth, National Library of Wales, MS. Peniarth 392 D (Hengwrt)
 Hk Norfolk, Holkham Hall, MS. 667
 Hl1 London, British Library, MS. Harley 1704
 Hl2 London, British Library, MS. Harley 2551
 Hl3 London, British Library, MS. Harley 2382
 Hl4 London, British Library, MS. Harley 5908
 Hn California, San Marino, Huntington Library, MS. HM 144
 Ht Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS. Hatton Donat.1
 Ii Cambridge, University Library, MS. Ii.3.26
 La London, British Library, MS. Lansdowne 851
 Lc Lichfield Cathedral, MS. 29
 Ld1 Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS. Laud Misc. 600
 Ld2 Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS. Laud Misc.739
 Ll1 Wiltshire, Longleat House, MS. Longleat 257
 Ll2 Wiltshire, Longleat House, MS. Longleat 29
 Ln Lincoln Cathedral Library, MS. 110
 Ma University of Manchester, John Rylands Library, MS. English 113
 Mc Chicago, University of Chicago Library, MS. 564 (McCormick)
 Me Aberystwyth, National Library of Wales, MS. 21972 D (Merthyr)
 Mg New York, Pierpont Morgan Library, MS. 249
 Mm Cambridge, University Library, MS. Mm.2.5
 Ne Oxford, New College, D.314
 Nl Northumberland, Alnwick Castle, MS. 455
 Np Naples, Royal Library, MS. XIII.B.29
 Ox1 University of Manchester, John Rylands Library, MS. English 63 (Oxford)
 Ox2 Philadelphia, Rosenbach Museum and Library, MS. 1084/2 (Oxford)
 Ph1 Austin, University of Texas, Humanities Research Center MS. 46 (Phillipps 6570)
 Ph2 Geneva, Bodmer Library, MS. 48 (Phillipps 8136)
 Ph3 Philadelphia, Rosenbach Museum and Library, MS. 1084/1 (Phillipps 8137)
 Ph4 California, San Marino, Huntington Library, MS. HM 140 (Phillipps 8299)

- Pl New York, Columbia University Library, MS. Plimpton 253 (Phillipps 9970)
- Pp Cambridge, Magdalene College, MS. Pepys 2006
- Ps Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, MS. Fonds Anglais 39
- Pw Sussex, Petworth House, MS. 7
- Py London, Royal College of Physicians, MS. 388
- Ra1 Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS. Rawl. poet.141
- Ra2 Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS. Rawl. poet.149
- Ra3 Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS. Rawl. poet.223
- Ra4 Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS. Rawl. poet C.86
- Ry1 London, British Library, MS. Royal 17 D.XV
- Ry2 London, British Library, MS. Royal 18 C.II
- Se Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS. Arch. Selden B.14
- Si Tokyo, Takamiya 22 (Sion College)
- Sl1 London, British Library, MS. Sloane 1685
- Sl2 London, British Library, MS. Sloane 1686
- Tc1 Cambridge, Trinity College, MS. R.3.3
- Tc2 Cambridge, Trinity College, MS. R.3.15
- Tc3 Cambridge, Trinity College, MS. R.3.19
- To1 Oxford, Trinity College, MS. 49
- To2 Oxford, Trinity College, MS. 29

Pre-1500 Printed Editions

- Cx1 William Caxton, first edition (c. 1476)
- Cx2 William Caxton, second edition (c. 1482)
- Pn Richard Pynson (1492)
- Wy Wynkyn de Worde (1498)

Abbreviations for Tales and Links¹

General Prologue	GP
The Knight's Tale	KT ²
Link 1 (The Miller's Prologue)	L1
The Miller's Tale	MI
Link 2 (The Reeve's Prologue)	L2
The Reeve's Tale	RE
Link 3 (The Cook's Prologue)	L3
The Cook's Tale	CO
Link 7 (The Man of Law's Prologue)	L7
The Man of Law's Tale	ML
Link 15 (The Merchant's Prologue)	L15
The Merchant's Tale	ME
Link 8 (The Man of Law's Endlink)	L8
The Squire's Tale	SQ
Link 20 (The Squire-Franklin Link)	L20
The Franklin's Tale	FK
The Wife of Bath's Prologue	WBP
The Wife of Bath's Tale	WBT ³
Link 10 (The Friar's Prologue)	L10
The Friar's Tale	FR
Link 11 (The Summoner's Prologue)	L11
The Summoner's Tale	SU
The Clerk's Tale	CL
Link 13 (Lenvoy de Chaucer)	L13
Link 14 (The Host Stanza)	L14
The Nun's Tale	NU

¹ For a detailed account of the Canterbury Tales Project's sigils and lineation system see Blake, "Lineation."

² KT is the only abbreviation in which I do not follow Blake's lineation system ("Lineation" 5-14). In this case I follow the abbreviation used in Stubbs, *The Hengwrt Chaucer Digital Facsimile*.

³ WBP and WBT correspond to Blake's WB.

Link 33 (The Canon's Yeoman's Prologue)	L33
The Canon's Yeoman's Tale	CY
The Physician's Tale	PH
Link 21 (The Physician/Pardoner Link)	L21
The Pardoner's Prologue and Tale	PD
The Shipman's Tale	SH
Link 24 (The Shipman/Prioress Link)	L13
The Prioress' Tale	PR
Link 25 (Prologue to Sir Thopas)	L25
The Tale of Sir Thopas	TT
Link 28 (Thopas/ Melibee Link)	L28
The Tale of Melibee	TM
Link 29 (The Monk's Prologue)	L29
The Monk's Tale	MO
Link 30 (The Nun's Priest's Prologue)	L30
The Nun's Priest's Tale	NP
Link 31 (The Nun's Priest's Endlink)	L31
Link 36 (The Manciple's Prologue)	L36
The Manciple's Tale	MA
Link 37 (The Parson's Prologue)	L37
The Parson's Tale	PA
Chaucer's Retraction	RT